

---

**From:** Craig Wingert [Craig.Wingert@noaa.gov]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 05, 2005 5:33 PM  
**To:** Fabian Alvarado  
**Subject:** RE Coho South of SF Petition

Hi Fabian --

This follows up on the phone message I left you last Friday. Was hoping you would give me a call back to discuss the petition and how I think we will need to proceed.

The bottom line is that we can't go through the process I discussed with you previously where we would publish a notice in the Federal Register accepting the petition. Accepting the petition would trigger a request for public review and comment on the petition and set us on a schedule to make a formal determination as to whether or not it was warranted. The main reason we can't accept the petition right now is because the Santa Cruz lab review of the petition does not support such a determination. I thought we could circumvent that, but it turns out that we really can't because its in the administrative record and we can't make the necessary determinations. To move forward from where we are, I think the best course of action now would be to seek external peer review of the petition and perhaps even the Santa Cruz review of the petition. You had suggested such a step to me in a previous conversation, so I'm hopeful you still think its an appropriate way to proceed. Similarly, the Santa Cruz lab suggested in their second memo to us that it might be appropriate to seek some external peer review -- and they suggested Peter Moyle (though you reacted negatively to Moyle as a peer reviewer in your response to their second memo). In summary, I think our decision making process on your petition requires some external peer review before we make a decision about whether or not to accept it and publish a notice in the Federal Register. I plan to seek multiple peer reviewers with the goal of having at least 3 review the petition materials and the lab review. I would like your input on the peer reviewers, so pls let me know who you think would be appropriate and I will proceed from there.

I would like to discuss this with you if you have some time tomorrow or Friday, so give me a call when you get a chance. My number is 562-980-4021.

Craig.